



**English Language Arts
Grade 4
Fall 2006**

**Response to the
Paired Reading Selections
Released Item #22
Scoring Guide**



1B: RESPONSE TO THE PAIRED READING SELECTIONS

DIRECTIONS:

Think about *both* of the selections in Part 1A as you answer the following question. You may look back at the selections as often as needed.

22 There are many ways to reach a goal. Do you agree or disagree?

Explain your answer using specific details and examples from *both* “*Presto Change-O! A Butterfly Appears*” and “*A Birthday Riddle*.” Be sure to show how the two selections are alike or connected.

Use the checklist on the next page to help you with your response. The Notes/Planning space may be used for writing down and organizing your ideas.

Your response must be written in the lined spaces starting on page 3 of your **Answer Document**. Only the writing in your **Answer Document** will be scored. No additional sheets may be used.

You may not use any resource materials (dictionaries, grammar books, spelling books, etc.) for any part of this test.

PART 1B: CHECKLIST FOR THE RESPONSE TO THE PAIRED READING SELECTIONS

DIRECTIONS:

Use this checklist to help you with your response. Your response must be written in the lined spaces starting on page 3 of your **Answer Document**.

CHECKLIST:

- _____ Do I take a position and clearly answer the question I was asked?
- _____ Do I support my answer with specific examples and details from *both* reading selections?
- _____ Do I show how the two reading selections are alike or connected?
- _____ Is my response complete?

NOTES/PLANNING

Michigan Educational Assessment Program

Rubric for the Response to the Paired Reading Selections

Grades 3–8

Here is an explanation of what scorers think about as they score this writing:

- 6** The student clearly and effectively chooses key or important ideas from each reading selection to support a position on the question and to make a clear connection between the reading selections. The position and connection are thoroughly developed with appropriate examples and details. There are no misconceptions about the reading selections. There are strong relationships among ideas. Mastery of language use and writing conventions contributes to the effect of the response.
- 5** The student makes meaningful use of key ideas from each reading selection to support a position on the question and to make a clear connection between the reading selections. The position and connection are well developed with appropriate examples and details. Minor misconceptions may be present. Relationships among ideas are clear. The language is controlled, and occasional lapses in writing conventions are hardly noticeable.
- 4** The student makes adequate use of ideas from each reading selection to support a position on the question and to make a connection between the reading selections. The position and connection are supported by examples and details. Minor misconceptions may be present. Language use is correct. Lapses in writing conventions are not distracting.
- 3** The student takes a clear position on the question. The response makes adequate use of ideas from one reading selection **or** partially successful use of ideas from both reading selections to support the position. The position is developed with limited use of examples and details. Misconceptions may indicate only a partial understanding of the reading. Language use is correct but limited. Incomplete mastery over writing conventions may interfere with meaning some of the time.
- 2** The student takes a clear position on the question. There is partially successful use of ideas from one reading selection **or** minimal use of ideas from both reading selections to support the position. The position is underdeveloped. Major misconceptions may indicate minimal understanding of the reading. Limited mastery over writing conventions may make the writing difficult to understand.
- 1** The student takes a position on the question but only makes minimal use of ideas from one reading selection **or** the student attempts to support an unclear position with minimal use of ideas from both reading selections. Ideas are not developed and may be unclear. Major misconceptions may indicate a lack of understanding of the reading. Lack of mastery over writing conventions may make the writing difficult to understand.

Condition codes for unratable papers (zeroes):

A – Off Topic

B – Written in a Language other than English or Illegible

C – Blank or Refusal to Respond

D – Retells or references the reading selections with no connection to the scenario question or theme

E – Responds to the scenario question with no reference to either of the reading selections

Anchor Paper 1

I agree that there are many ways to reaching a goal. Here's an example: If you don't know how to read then that could be your goal. For another example If you don't stay focused and talk a lot you could have stay focused and stop talking as your goal. IF you want specific details then each person still learning should have at least two goals while learning. Maybe even if you are doing really bad in school you could still have at least 3 goals. I could go on forever if I could but there so many ways that I can't keep track of them.

Anchor Paper 1
Score Point E

The student takes a position ("I agree") followed by the student's personal opinion concerning how to achieve a goal. There is no reference to either of the selections. The response is not text-based and in fact shows no tangible evidence of the student having read the two selections at all.

Anchor Paper 2

I learned today about Caterpillar's, and A Birthday Riddle. The Birthday Riddle is about a little boy's birthday and a Dad's birthday. The little boy Matthew had trouble finding a present for his dad because his dad was Raking leaf's and the Rake looked really rusty, but his dad said wow this Rake works well so Matthew said I guess I can't get him that, In Presto Chang-O the kid caught a caterpillar and he did something with it that was cool.

Well Matthew found out that his dad liked Working around at the house, because everything that he used worked finly. Matthew loved putting Riddle's on peoples presents that were in his family. When it was his dad's birthday he put a Riddle on his fathers present and his dad couldn't find out what the Riddle's awnser was. If they didn't know what the awnser was they could just Open up the present. Matthew gave his dad a note for his birthday. Then Matthews dad loved the note so much he said that he would take his whole family on a trip.

In Presto Chang-O, a kid found a catapillar and stuck it in a little fly catcher, and gave

it the same plant that it was eating.
The kid was acting very kind and not hurting
the caterpillar. The kid left the caterpillar alone
when it was getting into its chrysalis. When
the caterpillar got out of its chrysalis and its
wings could fly the kid let the butterfly go.
That is what I thought were my goals.

Anchor Paper 2**Score Point D**

The student fails to take a position. The response consists only of a lengthy summary of both selections that has no connection to the task in the prompt.

Anchor Paper 3

I think there connected because in each story
Someone talk's and it's a prosen taking too. there
alik because they talk about something sphite or cool
OR both. And there both alik because they both
have picchers.

Anchor Paper 3
Score Point D

The student fails to take a position but does attempt to make multiple connections. (“... in each story Someone talk's and it's a prosen taking too. there alik because they talk about something sphite or cool or both.”) Unfortunately, the connections offered are trivial in nature and demonstrate no meaningful understanding of the text. Holistically, the response has no meaningful connection to the prompt.

Anchor Paper 4

I agree there are many ways to reach a goal. In Prest-Exchange-O the caterpillar is wanting to be a anise swallowtail butterfly. I agree there are many ways to reach a goal.

Anchor Paper 4
Score Point 1

The student takes a position ("I agree") and offers minimal support only from Presto Change-O. ("In Prest-echange-O the caterpillar is wanting to be a anise swallowtail butterfly.")

Anchor Paper 5

I agree that there are many ways to reach a goal. In the story the caterpillar completed a goal. Every body can complete a goal, not just the characters in the story. Also mathew got his father a good present which was a goal he completed.

Anchor Paper 5**Score Point 1**

The student takes a position ("I agree") and supports it with a minimal reference from A Birthday Riddle. ("Also mathew got his father a good present which was a goal he completed") The attempt of support from Presto Change-O ("the caterpillar compleated a goal") is too brief and vague to be creditable.

Anchor Paper 6

Agree, because you can reach
a goal in both stories. Like
the butterfly getting out of
the cocoon. Like the kid trying
to make a riddle.

Anchor Paper 6**Score Point 2**

The student takes a position ("Agree") and provides minimal support from both selections. ("Like the butterfly getting out of the cocoon. Like the kid trying to make a riddle.") The support from Presto Change-O is descriptive of a method of achieving a goal while the support from A Birthday Riddle describes the goal itself. Either type of support is creditable.

Anchor Paper 7

Yes, I agree with the statement that there are many to reach a goal.

In the expository text *Preschool* a butterfly appears the caterpillar reaches a goal by going up the steps to be a butterfly. The butterfly is reaching goal to expaine it's wings

In the Narrative text *A birthday Riddle* Matthew is reaching a goal to find the best birthday present ever for his dad. Matthew is also reaching a goal to write a really well riddle.

In a conclusion both texts are alike in ~~one~~ ways like, they both have the same theme of reaching a goal.

Anchor Paper 7
Score Point 2

The student takes a position ("Yes, I agree") and supports it with minimal references from both selections. ("...the caterpillar reaches a goal by going up the steps to be a butterfly. The butterfly is reaching a goal to expaine it's wings. . . . Matthew is reaching a goal to find the best birthday present ever for his dad. Matthew is also reaching a goal to write a really well riddle.")

Anchor Paper 8

Prompt: There are many ways to reach a goal. do you agree or disagree?

I agree, there is many ways to reach a goal. In the story "the birthday riddle" Matthew had reached his goal. His goal was that he had to find a present with a riddle. He reached his goal by watching his dad to work all time so he could find a present with a riddle.

In the story "Presto change-o! A Butterfly Appears" A caterpillar had to reach a goal. The caterpillars goal was to turn into a butterfly. How the caterpillar reached it's goal was he kept on eating so it could turn into a butterfly.

Anchor Paper 8
Score Point 3

The student takes a position ("I agree") and provides partially successful support from A Birthday Riddle and Presto Change-O. In both references, the student goes beyond the mere naming of the goal to include brief but effective explanation of how the goal was achieved. ("He reached his goal by watching his dad to work all time . . . How the caterpillar reached it's goal was he kept on eating so it could turn into a butterfly.")

Anchor Paper 9

I agree because! in Presto Change -O! A butter-fly appears the caterpillar plans on eating so it can grow and make a chrysalis and form slowly into a butterfly. And in the story A Birthday Riddle Matthew has a goal to get his dad the perfect gift and the perfect riddle and he watches his dad rake leaves, wash the car, & clean his fishing reel. All those things were old, & rusty, so he thought he would want new ones. But all those things were special to his father, so he thought about in more and he new the perfect gift and riddle. He put all those things together and made a letter saying... "I'll help you rake leaves, wash the car, and I'll be your fishing buddy!"

Both stories are about different ways you can reach a goal!

**Anchor Paper 9
Score Point 3**

The student takes a position ("I agree") and makes a partially successful reference from Presto Change-O ("... the caterpillar plans on eating so it can grow and make a chrysalis and for slowly into a butterfly.") and adequate use of ideas from A Birthday Riddle ("... he watches his dad rakes leaves, wash the car, & clean his fishing reel. . . . But all those things were special to his father. . . . He put all those things together. . ."). Unfortunately, the attempt at a connection ("Both stores are about different ways you can reach a goal!") merely repeats prompt language, which is not creditable.

Anchor Paper 10

I agree that there is many ways to reach a goal. Because in Presto Change-o this kid kept watching the catapiler so he could see how beutifal it looked, see he could of drew a picture of it instead. The same with a birthday riddle, he kept trying & trying to find a present for his Dad & he finally found, & after watching his dad to see what he likes.

The way the two sections are alike, a that both of the kids were trying to fill their goals. They both had to watch something to find out what they needed. Also at the ending of the story they both fulfilled their goal because they tried hard & kept a close eye on their object.

Anchor Paper 10**Score Point 4**

The student takes a position ("I agree") and provides an adequate reference from both selections. ("... this kid kept watching the caterpillar so he could see how beautiful it looked, see he could of drew a picture of it instead. . . . he kept trying to find a present for his Dad & he finally found it after watching his dad to see what he likes.") Finally, the student provides a valid connection. ("They both had to watch something to find out what they needed.") All the necessary components (position, valid support from both texts, valid connection) are present for a score point of 4.

Anchor Paper 11

I disagree that there are many ways to reach; I can prove it by giving details from the stories "Presto-Chango! A Butterfly Appears" and the story "A Birthday Riddle".

In "Presto-Chango! A Butterfly appears there is only one way to watch the metamorphosis of a caterpillar. The only way to do it is by paying close attention. The author even said he payed close attention. If he didn't pay close attention, he might of missed an important part of the caterpillar's metamorphosis!

Also, in "A Birthday Riddle" there is only one way to achieve a goal. Matthew's goal of finding a present for his dad was also achived by paying close attention. He watch him rake, wash the car, and also watched him clean his fishing. He watched everything very closely to find a

gift for his dad.

Both "Presto-Chango! A Butterfly Appears!" and "A Birthday Riddle" prove that there is only one way to reach goals. I hope you agree with me and pay attention to the details that prove that.

Anchor Paper 11**Score Point 4**

The student takes a contrarian position ("I disagree") and provides an adequate use of ideas from both selections. ("...there is only one way to watch the metamorphosis of a caterpillar. The only way to do it is by paying close attention. . . . Matthew's goal of finding a present for his dad was also achieved by paying close attention. He watched him rake, wash the car, and also watched him clean his fishing.") Finally, a valid connection is established ("paying close attention . . . paying close attention").

Anchor Paper 12

Yes, I agree with the statement that there is many ways to reach a goal.

In the expository text "Presto Change-O! A Butterfly Appears" there is a goal trying to be reached that is that the author wants to write about and raise a butterfly. There is many ways to do this. I will tell two ways. One way is to watch and watch a butterfly. The other way is to look in books and watch them grow.

In the narrative text "Birthday Riddle" there is also a goal trying to be reached by a boy, Matthew, who is trying to give the best present to his father there are many ways to accomplish this goal. One way is to watch the dad and a idea will pop out or ask a member of the family and maybe they'll know.

In conclusion both text are alike in several ways. This is only two. One is that in both selections there was a goal to be reached and both goals

could be accomplished several ways. Second is that the goal in both selections were completed and the goal is now a completed goal.
So as you can see there are several ways to reach a goal!

Anchor Paper 12**Score Point 4**

The student takes a position (“I agree”) and provides an adequate use of ideas from Presto Change-O. (“... the author wants to write about and raise a butterfly. . . . One way is to catch and watch a butterfly.”) The response continues with support from A Birthday Riddle (“One way is to watch the dad . . .”). Finally, the response (“One way is to catch and watch a butterfly . . . One way is to watch the dad”) makes a valid connection between the two texts.

Anchor Paper 13

I do think that are a lot of ways to reach your goal. I think in the story "Presto-Change-o" to make it to the goal of getting a butterfly from a caterpieler. You have to catch it then you have to feed it then wait. Or you could just catch a butterfly! In the story "A Birthday Riddle" Matthew had to find out what his father wanted before he could just have family time for a present. Or he could have got something that he already had and he could make a riddle to go with it.

The stories are alike because in both stories somebody gets a present. In "Presto Change-o" the person that catchered the caterpieler got a butterfly! In the story "A Birthday Riddle" Matthew gets a glove for catching flies, and his father got the present of father and son time. That is how they are connected.

Anchor Paper 13
Score Point 5

The student takes a position ("I do think that are a lot of ways to reach your goal.") and makes meaningful use of key ideas from each reading selection. The support for each is thorough and well developed. Insight is evident, especially in the connection provided. ("... in both stories somebody gets a present. . . . the person that catchered the caterpieler got a butterfly! . . . his father got the present of father and son time.")

Anchor Paper 14

Yes, I agree with the statement that there are many ways to reach a goal.

In the expository text "Presto Change-O! A Butterfly Appears" I have found a few different examples of ways to reach a goal. First a caterpillar's goal is to become a butterfly and live a long life. In this text the caterpillar can reach its goal by eating what it needs to eat and then forming a chrysalis and hatch into a healthy butterfly and then finding a mate and producing eggs. Another way for a caterpillar to have a successful metamorphosis is when the caterpillar is born they should eat a lot to store energy and then form a chrysalis. When the chrysalis turns black it means the caterpillar will soon hatch. When it does that even if it doesn't find a mate and it doesn't produce eggs it will still have reached its goal. So there are many examples of reaching

a goal in different ways in this text.

In the narrative text "A Birthday Riddle" there are many ways to reach the same goal. Matthew's goal in this text was to give his father a good gift and make up a good riddle to go along with it. One way he could of did it and reached his goal is he could of gotten his father a new rake or a new car brush or a new fishing reel and he could of made up a good riddle and his father probably would have been satisfied. Or he could have given him one of the best gifts of all, a gift from the heart and his father would surely be satisfied. There are many ways Matthew could have reached his goal in this story.

Both texts, "Presto Change-O! A Butterfly Appears" and "A Birthday Riddle" are alike in two ways. First off both texts share the same theme, determination. Also both authors have the main characters trying to overcome a challenge that occurs to other butterflys and other people. I now know that both of these texts can be alike in many different ways.

Anchor Paper 14**Score Point 6**

The student takes a position (*“Yes, I agree”*) and clearly and effectively chooses key or important ideas from each reading selection to support his/her position. (*“ . . . even if it doesn’t find a mate and it doesn’t produce eggs it will still have reached it’s goal. . . . Or he could of given him one of the best gifts of all, a gift from the heart and his father would surely be satisfied.”*) The student makes meaningful use of key ideas from each reading selection. The support for each is thorough and well developed. Insight is evident, especially in the connection provided. (*“ . . . both text share the same theme, determination. Also both authors have the main characters trying to overcome a challenge that occurs . . . ”*)